

**RALEIGH TRANSIT AUTHORITY
JUNE 14, 2012
MINUTES**

The Raleigh Transit Authority met on Thursday, June 14, 2012 at 3:30 p.m. in the City Council Chamber, Room 201 of the Municipal Building, Raleigh, N. C., with the following present:

Chairman Joseph Springer, presiding
Gerry Cohen
Jason Horne
Roger Kosak
Les Seitz
Jane Thurman
Uel Whitsett

Staff present: David Eatman, Mike Kennon, Scott McClellan, Lindsey Pinnell

Chairman Springer called the meeting to order with discussion and actions taken as shown:

AGENDA – APPROVED AS AMENDED

Mr. Kosak indicated he would be adding discussion of an article that appeared in The News and Observer today relating to bus drivers. Chairman Springer stated he would add discussion relating to merger of CAT and Triangle Transit that was discussed at the Council's Law & Public Safety Committee meeting. It was agreed to add discussion of these item to the agenda.

MINUTES – MAY 10, 2012 – APPROVED AS PRESENTED

Members received in their packets a copy of the May 10, 2012 minutes. Mr. Kosak moved approval of the minutes as presented. His motion was seconded by Ms. Thurman, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

GO-PASS AGREEMENTS – APPROVED

Mr. Eatman explained GoTriangle Partners have introduced a program that helps employees conveniently travel to work using transit – the GoPass Program. This is a contractual program designed to allow employees to ride the bus without cost by simply swiping their “GoPass” card in the fare box on any Capital Area Transit or Triangle Transit bus. Members received in their packets a copy of the agreements that are for one full year which begins in July with the exception of NCSU which begins in August and the NC State Bar which is a six month pilot program beginning July 2012 and noted they

may want to do this permanently. Mr. Eatman explained the passes are tracked and the agencies billed monthly. He further noted these are existing rates and existing terms.

Mr. Seitz moved approval of the agreements as presented. His motion was seconded by Mr. Kosak, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

FINANCE COMMITTEE POLICIES – APPROVED

Mr. Eatman explained members received in their packets the following listed policies have been amended by the Finance Committee and have been recommended for adoption by the full Transit Authority:

- Eating, Drinking or operating Audio Equipment on Buses Policy
- Accessibility Policy
- Elderly and Persons with Disabilities Fare Policy
- Reduced Fare for Non-Profit Organizations Policy

The Route Productivity Policy remains in development and will be submitted to the Authority upon its completion.

Mr. Eatman explained this is the first time the Authority has seen these policies with the new changes. Only minor changes were made. He explained staff would be amenable to bringing these back at a future meeting if members need to review them further.

Mr. Kosak reported the Finance Committee reviewed these policy changes thoroughly and they are updated and ready to move forward. Mr. Seitz questioned if there is currently a productivity policy with Mr. Eatman stating fare box recovery is used and a general comparison of routes. Expectations for cross town services are not the same as radial services. Staff desires to come up with better methodology of what should be compared against itself.

Mr. Seitz moved approval of the policies as written and provided in the packets. His motion was seconded by Mr. Kosak, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

CAT & TTA MERGER CONSIDERATION – DISCUSSION

Mr. Kosak referred to a Letter to the Editor appearing in The News and Observer today. The letter complained about the fact there are no bus shelters. He explained the primary reason he asked to be placed on the Transit Authority was the fact he was tired of seeing people waiting in the rain for a bus. He stressed tremendous strides have been made in the last 3 years noting there are funding and design standards in place and many benches and shelters have been installed and places where there were no concrete pads have been improved so those waiting do not have to stand in the mud. Mr. Kosak stated he is going to ask staff for information on how many benches and shelters have been put in place in

the last 3 years, how many will be installed next year and how many are proposed in the future and would write a letter to the newspaper in response to the letter appearing in the newspaper today. He stated this letter cannot go unanswered. Mr. Cohen agreed that a lot of efforts have gone into shelters and benches. Mr. Seitz stated the general public needs to realize our system is inadequate but only so much can be done. He noted the general public should get involved if we have a transit system that meets our needs.

Mr. Eatman explained the bond passed earlier this year provided \$750,000 funding for additional bus shelters and that funding is all local money. The Transit Program will use that money wisely and will be looking for additional resources where we can use local dollars to leverage state and federal dollars. Those bond funds will be available July 1 and will develop an ordinance and lock those funds when the new fiscal year begins.

The item was received as information.

CAPITAL AREA TRANSIT SHORT RANGE TRANSIT PLAN – PUBLIC COMMENTS – INFORMATION RECEIVED

Mr. Eatman explained HDR and Planning Communities assisted staff with the presentation and the collection of public comments regarding the Capital Area Transit Short Range Transit Plan. Comments were provided to members in the agenda packet. They should be thoroughly reviewed as they will assist the Transit Authority with a final decision regarding the implementation of the plan. Mr. Eatman indicated in the last month staff had attended the East CAC, North CAC, Southwest CAC and Southeast CAC meetings to present the plan. Staff is further planning to attend the North Central CAC meeting in the next 30 days. Staff is still seeking and receiving comments. As this continues to move forward, staff proposes to finalize the process with a public hearing at some point. Mr. Eatman stated the plan is a very good plan but would like one final review of the comments received and wanted to be sure there are no flaws. Staff would like to have the public hearing in August and once the hearing is held, it is full speed ahead for finalizing the plan.

Mr. Seitz indicated at the previous meeting, Mr. Fitzgerald from the Rescue Mission mentioned the curtailing of early morning runs and questioned if staff had met with him. Mr. Eatman indicated it was his understanding Mr. Fitzgerald was worried about any of the runs being cut. He noted staff understands any move made will impact someone and is trying very hard to be sure to cover our resources on New Bern Avenue and Capital Boulevard corridors.

Mr. Kosak noted staff should not force timing and should go ahead and go with staff's recommendation and have the hearing on the August agenda. He further indicated he thought Rescue Mission representatives were going to get together with Mr. Ralph, chair of the Route Committee, and tell him how people would lose their jobs if those routes are cut. Mr. Kosak stated from studies done, a majority of the people using public transportation have no other alternative. He questioned the possible of getting some

fiscal relief on the changes that have to be made noting it appears people are getting raises in City government and did not see why CAT can't get a raise as well.

This item was received as information.

STATE BUS RODEO – INTRODUCTION OF FIRST PLACE WINNER

Mr. McClellan introduced Rodney , first pace winner in the State Bus Rodeo held in May. The Regional Rodeo was held in April and he did very well there. The CAT team went to the State Rodeo where Mr. won first place. To be eligible to compete the driver has to operate without an accident, have good attendance record, good customer skills, driving course, written test, appearance, etc. Mr. McClellan indicated CAT is honored to have him on our team. He will be sent to compete for the National Rodeo held in Indianapolis. Mr. Kosak indicated this recognition should also be presented to the City Council.

FINANCE COMMITTEE – REPORT RECEIVED

Mr. Kosak reported the Finance Committee did not meet since the last meeting. The only item pending is the No Smoking Policy at Moore Square Station. He noted the Committee is waiting for the City Attorney's review of the proposed policy. It was agreed to place this item on the next Finance Committee agenda where a recommendation could be made to have the City Attorney draft an ordinance.

PUBLIC COMMENTS – RECEIVED

Jerry Dolan - indicated he and his wife took 2 bus rides from his home in North Raleigh near Towne North Shopping Center to Downtown Raleigh in order to see what riding the bus is like. The first ride got them from Crabtree to Glenwood South in 10 minutes. Later in the night they could not get back. He questioned the changing numbers of the routes as a result of the time of day changing. They ended up taking a taxicab home on this trip. He also questioned why there is no live call in on weekends. Mr. Dolan noted the second trip was to Artspllosure and 100% of the trip was on the bus. They got on the bus at Towne North and then transferred at Crabtree. He referred to the 1 hour wait at Crabtree noting buses only came every hour on weekends. The trip that took 10 minutes previously took 1 hour this time and they had to go by Rex Hospital. The driver of this bus was cold and unfriendly. Mr. Dolan indicated the lady at the Moore Square Booth was also unfriendly. The return trip bus driver was nice. Mr. Dolan indicated he is the rider the City wants to have on this multimillion dollar transit system that is supposed to be implemented noting the poor people with no alternative already ride the bus. He questioned how it is expected to get people like him into the buses. Mr. Dolan indicated the RLine is really nice and has a whole range of people using it. He further questioned why there are not dedicated express buses from the outskirts of town, i.e., North Ridge, Towne North, etc. He felt people like him are not being enticed to ride the bus. Mr. Dolan urged the City to get people like him onto the buses now so they have a habit of

looking to buses as a way to get around. He stated it is hard to commute using buses and the system does not seem very new user friendly.

Mr. Eatman explained the CAT system has not received funding for having more buses similar to RLine and services from outlying areas coming to Downtown Raleigh. Funding has not been received for these types of services and the system has actually eaten inflation for 4 years and the increased fuel prices. Mr. Eatman stressed this is not anybody's fault noting times are there is a huge transit discussion going on with Wake County now. He spoke to the requirement of living within our financial environment. Mr. Eatman explained buses will be seen every now and then with few people but we are at capacity during peak hours on some major routes. He stated it is not as bright an immediate future we see but what is being done is shoring up the system and looking for additional resources in order to move forward efficiently in the future. He understood the system is not there at the level to entice everyone. Mr. Dolan indicated he was there was no connection and would be willing to pay \$10 if direct services were available to places such as Walnut Creek, Convention Center, etc.

Mr. Cohen indicated when he was appointed to the Authority, we were in year 3 of a 5 Year Plan and are now at year 3 of an 8 year plan. The Authority has asked the City Council for increased funding for increased services many times and nothing has been granted. The City Council is unwilling to increase taxes to provide this funding. Mr. Cohen reviewed what the Transit Plan calls for if approved.

Mr. Kosak stated it is a mystery why, with as bad a time we have had and increase in riders we have had, that the Authority has not been able to obtain more resources. He advised Mr. Dolan that the Authority is acutely aware of what he was saying and if funds were available, the system would be improved. He noted the addition of RLine has made a big impact on Downtown and the ability of riders to get around Downtown and enjoy themselves. He thanked Mr. Fitzgerald for his comments.

Graham Oliver – expressed disappointment with the County Commissioners who failed to call for a referendum on the ½ cent sales tax for public transit. He indicated this is an area that is going to see great improvements and the high speed rail system from Washington to Charlotte will impact this area. Knightdale's expansion of I-540 areas will put them in a situation to capitalize on Raleigh to Knightdale transit. He stated Knightdale was previously just a cross roads and now is expanding into Raleigh.

MARKETING COMMITTEE REPORT – RECEIVED

Summer Youth Pass Program - Ms. Thurman reported the Marketing Committee met on May 22, 2012. One item discussed related to instituting a Summer Youth Pass Program that would allow teens to use the bus service for free to help get to employment, etc. She felt this is a great idea and the Committee will be working on this further in future meetings. Mr. Eatman stated this is an interesting program done in other cities. This is the age the teenagers are getting jobs and needing summer transportation noting

teens are getting their licenses later. He indicated he was looking forward to putting this program together. Ms. Thurman hoped to get this program going for next summer.

Adopt-A-Shelter Program - Approved – Ms. Thurman reported the City Attorney has approved the contract document proposed by the Authority. Mr. Ralph has gone to the Raleigh CAC and will attend the West Raleigh CAC next Tuesday to determine if they would like to adopt a shelter.

Ms. Pinnell provided members with a list of Adopt-A-Shelter locations. Those adopting a shelter would be reporting in one time per month. She presented the decal that would be placed in the shelter recognizing the person or organization that adopted the shelter so they will be recognized. She explained to go further, approval of the program would be required by the Authority. Ms. Pinnell hoped to begin this program July 1, 2012. Ms. Thurman spoke to the desire to have local television stations providing press on this program. Mr. Kosak moved adoption of the program using documentation approved by the City Attorney to contract with individuals. His motion was seconded by Mr. Seitz, unanimously passed. Chairman Springer ruled the motion adopted.

Capital Area Transit Website – Ms. Thurman reported the website is a work in progress.

Bus Shelter Advertising – This item is pending in committee.

Ms. Thurman invited the entire Transit Authority and staff, maybe as part of branding, to assist in coming up with a list of goals and what the Authority can do as an organization to help market transit. She spoke to the need to have a work plan. The Authority will hear more about this at a later meeting. Staff is working on finding a location for a workshop on possibly a Friday morning or afternoon to discuss this.

ROUTE COMMITTEE REPORT – RECEIVED

Mr. Eatman indicated he received an email from Mr. Ralph suggesting that the Authority move forward with the Short Range Plan as currently developed and set a public hearing on this item. He explained staff is suggesting August 9 for the hearing at the regular Authority meeting. Any changes needed to the plan can be done before that date.

Mr. Eatman discussed the July meeting date noting July is challenging for everyone and the chairman of the Route Committee indicated he would like to move this item to hearing. It was agreed to schedule the hearing for the August 9 meeting.

CAT & TRIANGLE TRANSIT POSSIBLE MERGER CONSIDERATION – INFORMATION RECEIVED

Chairman Springer reported the Council's Law & Public Safety Committee discussed the possibility of CAT & Triangle Transit and staff and Authority members were in attendance at the meeting.

Mr. Eatman provided an overview of the discussion at the meeting noting this was a meeting where staff was requested to present information relating to possible merger or increased cooperation between CAT and Triangle Transit. The item was originally discussed in the City Council meeting and Councillor Baldwin requested the item go to Law and Public Safety Committee. Mr. Eatman reported at the Law and Public Safety Committee meeting staff presented a memo relating to general information regarding current activities by CAT and some activities that occurred in Durham's management oversight contract. He advised Authority members a copy of the document provided to the Law and Public Safety Committee will be provided to them. Once staff provided the Committee with information to recap those items, Triangle Transit then went through what they are doing in Durham. Mr. Eatman explained his take of both presentations was agreement that CAT and DATA are completely different systems and were in completely different places. The meeting ending with staff being directed to contact Triangle Transit within 90 days and report back to Law & Public Safety Committee to determine if there is opportunity for increased cooperation. Staff has been in contact with Triangle Transit and had not received a meeting date back from them yet. Mr. Eatman indicated there are discussions occurring at this point and if additional information comes up the Authority will be advised. Authority members will also be advised when this item is scheduled to again come before Law & Public Safety. Members of the Transit Authority also spoke at that meeting.

Mr. Kosak stated the only thing that was important was the fact Durham is in a different position from an operational and fiscal standpoint than CAT when they requested help. CAT is ahead of schedule on the budget and has a handle on rate changes and will have to now take up slack and make changes on routes. CAT is making changes due to overloads and it appears we are efficient. Durham is also very tightly located and Raleigh is very large and spread out.

Ms. Thurman indicated everything is there noting CAT has a live website but people do not know about it. She stressed marketing is needed and felt there should be collaboration with TTA marketing staff and CAT staff to determine a better way to achieve what we are trying to do. Ms. Thurman felt if RTA presented a work plan to the Council every year like other boards and commissions and document goals and what we are working on, the Council would know what is going on with CAT. This would expose the Council to CAT and the Authority. Mr. Eatman noted there has never been an up front work plan. Ms. Thurman indicated a work plan is important and suggested that each committee have a statement on what they are doing which is excellent public relations.

Mr. Kosak stated he understood staff made a presentation during the budget relating to CAT plans. Mr. Eatman explained generally the Authority adopts a 3-5 year transit plan which is CAT's work plan. He noted Ms. Thurman had a valid point noting the transit plan does not hit on shelters, web marketing and other items supporting the overall mission of expanding service and gaining ridership. He indicated this is something that should be reviewed. Mr. Kennon pointed out 5 years ago there was an annual report where the chairman would advise the Council what the Authority had accomplished in the last year but had never seen a work plan presented.

In regard to the discussions that took place at the Law & Public Safety Committee meeting, Mr. Kennon indicated he was puzzled and thought staff laid out good reasoning why situations are different between the 2 systems and yet it is still on the table to discuss and was unclear what to take back. He had discussed this with David King who is also unclear and are both tied up with Federal revisions this week. Mr. Kennon stated the goal is to get together with Mr. King next week but was not clear at this point what Ms. Baldwin is looking for. Mr. Seitz agreed and was also not sure what the Law & Public Safety Committee wants to come back in 90 days.

Mr. Kennon spoke to the need for the Authority to have a unified voice and thought the message from the Transit Authority at the meeting was somewhat neutral. Mr. Seitz stated, in thinking about what might be included in the report, it could be relayed to the Council how the Transit Authority is working together currently and make them aware of what is happening now and stress there would be no monetary savings with merging. Mr. Seitz felt the message was consistent between the Authority and Staff. He further felt we would like to see more of a seamless system where the general public may not think much about if they are riding CAT or Triangle Transit and we have done fare alignments. He was aware TTA and CAT staff is working closely and have done so since this was discussed 5 years ago. Mr. Seitz noted possibly the report could contain a joint initiatives being carried out and any future binding, collaborating or plan to fix up the website, etc.

Mr. Kosak stated he received no clear message from the 3 people on the committee of what they wanted to do. He suggested development of a really well thought out update of the CAT website integrated with TTA's website. Mr. Kosak indicated he got the feeling this whole website issue was this was not the Raleigh Transit Authority website but a City of Raleigh website and felt someone needs to change that attitude.

Mr. Kennon explained in the past the website was fragmented and 4 years ago there was effort to bring everyone together which has been done. He indicated right now the City Transit website is information about how you ride the bus and looking at brochures on line but doesn't help plan trips on the bus. The trip planning is in the Triangle.org website and the issue with trip planning is something we need to talk to them about. Mr. Eatman noted staff is looking at going completely to Google regionally.

Mr. Seitz questioned what we can offer to the Council to satisfy their interest in merging. A report has been suggested sharing what has been done thus far with TTA and a list of

current endeavors to improve the website and marketing. He felt the Council should be advised the Authority is doing all it can to improve the way the transit system appears to customers.

Chairman Springer questioned if the thinking is relating to the Transit Authority managing the system here noting he has been a member of this Authority for 7 years and felt CAT's management staff is fantastic. Mr. Seitz responded the Council is no longer thinking of TTA staff managing our system and felt that was dealt with in the meeting. He did not think the Law & Public Safety Committee is talking about merging since there is no monetary savings, etc. He also noted the Transit Authority came forward with the same message and the Council is agreeable there will be no savings. Mr. Kennon felt there is some interest in allowing TTA to manage the system similar to Durham's system. He encouraged members if they are not interested in that management possibility, they need to say so. Chairman Springer stated the Authority has an opportunity to say it does not think there should be a staff merger and indicate the Authority is continuing the relationship we have right now and develop items being worked on. He felt it should be stated the Authority opposed management or other collaboration other than what we are working on now. Mr. Kosak agreed this should be made clear from the Authority. Mr. Seitz suggested sending a letter to clarify this and as a follow up to the meeting. Mr. Kennon indicated the position should be made clear and be a unified message.

Mr. Kennon questioned if the Authority would like the letter being discussed to be sent now or in 90 days when the item goes back to Law & Public Safety. Mr. Eatman indicated he would draft a letter for the chairman's distribution to other members. Chairman Springer noted members could review the letter and vote on it electronically.

STAFF REPORTS – RECEIVED

Members received in their agenda packets the following staff reports:

1. Statement of Income and Loss (April 2012)
2. Operating Statistics (April 2012)
3. Evaluation by Route (April 2012)
4. Productivity by Route (April 2012)
5. Variance Analysis (April 2012)
6. Go PASS Ridership Summary (April 2012)
7. Go PASS Ridership by Agency (April 2012)
8. Accessible Raleigh Transportation Summary (April 2012)

Mr. Eatman reported ridership continues to be up and is growing. In regard to the budget, Mr. Eatman indicated this is the tightest budget year he has ever had in transit. He indicated we are doing fine and will be okay but it was a tight year. With changes to ART and projected changes next year, things will be better.

The reports were received as information.

AUTHORITY MEMBERS – COMMENTS

Mr. Horne appreciated staff and all the good things occurring. He looked forward to the Adopt-A-Shelter Program and was looking forward to the next meeting.

Mr. Seitz indicated he is looking forward to the Summer Youth Passes.

Ms. Thurman thanked staff for holding the hearings on the transit plan noting she was impressed by comments received. Some great ideas were received and some compliments were also received.

STAFF – COMMENTS

Mr. Kennon reported the last 2 days staff has been in Federal reviews. They are looking at 20+ areas of the transit system including financial, maintenance, facilities, etc. He noted this is 3rd or 4th time and indicated this was the best review we have ever had. There was 1 minor comment regarding the work flow issue and that has been taken care of. He thanked staff for a good job and noted the maintenance facility was spotless.

Mr. Eatman appreciated everyone's help in the review. He outlined what is involved in this review.

CHAIRMAN'S REPORT

Chairman Springer complimented staff for their work noting he did not think anyone could manage this entity better than the staff we have.

JULY MEETING – CANCELLED

Mr. Eatman indicated he knew of nothing that would have to be handled in July. Without objection, it was agreed the next meeting will be August 9, 2012.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:05 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Brenda Hunt

Raleigh Transit Authority
June 14, 2012